# IN THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI

# **ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.628 OF 2023**

DISTRICT : THANE SUBJECT : TRANSFER

Shri Rahul Ashok Pawar,	)
Aged 45 years, Working as Inspector of Motor	)
Vehicles in the office of the Deputy Regional Transport	)
Office, Kalyan, Sahyadri Nagar, Chicken Ghar,	)
Kalyan (West), Dist. Thane,	)
R/o. Claramont, 'A' Wing, 1501, Lodha Luxria,	)
Majiwada, Thane.	) Applicant

#### Versus

The State of Maharashtra, ) Through the Principal Secretary, Home Department ) (Transport), Having Office at Mantralaya, Mumbai 32. )... **Respondents** 

Shri Arvind V. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for the Applicant along with Ms. Pushpa Ganediwala, learned Special Counsel.

Shri Ashok J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

CORAM : DEBASHISH CHAKRABARTY, MEMBER (A)

DATE : 04.01.2024.

## JUDGMENT

1. The Applicant Shri Rahul Ashok Pawar who was working as Inspector of Motor Vehicles in the office of Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane has challenged the Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 of Home Department (Transport) to post him to the office of Dy. RTO; Beed, District Beed by invoking provisions of Section 19 of The Administrative Tribunal Act, 1985.

2. The Applicant was represented by Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate Ms. Pushpa Gandiwale, learned Special Counsel represented Respondent. The Respondent was represented by Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer. 3. The learned Advocate for Applicant stated that by Transfer Order dated 09.08.2021 of Home Department (Transport) the Applicant was posted as Inspector of Motor Vehicles in the office of Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane. However, without allowing the Applicant to complete his Normal Tenure of 3 years, the Home Department (Transport) by Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023, has posted the Applicant to the office of Dy. RTO; Beed, District Beed.

4. The learned Advocate for the Applicant further stated that vide communication dated 24.05.2023; the Home Department (Transport) directed the Transport Commissioner, Mumbai to serve upon the Applicant and few Inspectors of Motor Vehicles' the copies of their Transfer Orders dated 24.05.2023. The Applicant states that immediately thereafter Dy. RTO, Kalyan, District Thane issued Office Order dated 25.05.2023 to relieve the Applicant from the post of Inspector of Motor Vehicles. The learned Advocate for the Applicant insisted that till date the Applicant has not been officially served with the copy of Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 of Home Department (Transport) by which he now stands posted to the office of Dy. R.T.O; Beed, District Beed.

5. The learned Advocate for the Applicant then stated that the Applicant was not due for transfer as he has completed just One Year and 10 Months as against his Normal Tenure of 3 years in the office of Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane. The Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 of Home Department (Transport) refers to the 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 submitted by the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City to the Respondent who is Principal Secretary; Transport & Ports, Home Department. The 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 of the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City recommends immediate transfer of the Applicant and few Inspectors of Motor Vehicle named therein to places out of Nagpur Region on 'Non-Executive Posts'; so as to prevent any interference by them in ongoing investigations of Criminal Cases

registered in connection with the alleged 'Transfer Scam' of Transport Department.

6. The learned Advocate for the Applicant argued that so far as the Applicant is concerned, he was not working in Nagpur Region but in Mumbai Metropolitan Region serving on the post of Inspector of Motor Vehicle in office of Dy RTO; Kalyan District, Thane. Thus, he was not serving in Nagpur Region and therefore the 'Interim Report' of Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City dated 03.04.2023 could not have been the reason to effect 'Mid-Tenure' transfer of the Applicant to the office of Dy. R.T.O.; Beed, Beed District. The reason for issue of Transfer Orders dated 24.05.2023 by Home Department (Transport) in respect of other Inspectors of Motor Vehicles who were all working in Nagpur Region may have ostensibly been to prevent any interference by them in the on-going investigations of Criminal Cases registered in connection with the alleged 'Transfer Scam' of Transport Department being conducted by Deputy Commissioner of Police (EOW), Nagpur City under the overall supervision of Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City. The Applicant was already working away from Nagpur Region, in the office of the Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane which is located in Mumbai Metropolitan Region. Thus, there was never any possibility of interference by the Applicant in the on-going investigations of Criminal Cases registered in connection with the alleged 'Transfer Scam' of Transport Department. The Applicant therefore made an application to the Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home Department on 29.05.2023 with request for cancellation of his Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 to the office of Dy. RTO; Beed, Beed District. Learned Advocate for the Applicant fairly admitted that after having been relieved on 25.05.2023, Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane by the Applicant has not joined on the post of Inspector of Motor Vehicles in the office of Dy. RTO; Beed, District Beed.

7. The learned P.O. on behalf of the Respondent relied on the contents of 'Affidavit-in-Reply' dated 17.07.2023 and Affidavit-in-Sur Rejoinder dated 07.09.2023.

8. The learned P.O. elaborated on the contents of the 'Interim Report' submitted on 03.04.2023 by Commissioner of Police Nagpur, (City) to the Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home Department. The Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 of the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City states that an 'Audio Clip' of the alleged 'Transfer Scam' in 'Transport Department' had been made viral in 'Electronic Media' and Print Media'. Hence, the Chief Ministers Office (CMO) had issued orders for thorough Police Investigations. Accordingly, Police Investigations into this alleged 'Transfer Scam' was being done by the 'Deputy Commissioner of Police, (EOW), Nagpur City' under overall supervision of the 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City'. Learned P.O. then mentioned that in 'Status of Investigation' report submitted by 'Deputy Commissioner of Police, (EOW), Nagpur City' on 23.03.2023 to the Commissioner of Police Nagpur City, it had been specifically mentioned how several officers of the Transport Department were actively involved in this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. Further, it mentions that even witnesses have not come forward to record their statements before the Investigating Officers on account of pressure being exerted by these Inspectors of Motor Vehicles who are allegedly involved in this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. In order to complete impartial investigations the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City by his 'Interim Report' dated on 03.04.2023 had requested for immediate transfer of these Inspectors of Motor Vehicle on 'Non-Executive Posts' outside of Nagpur Region. The detailed report dated 23.03.2023 regarding 'Status of Investigation' submitted by the 'Deputy Commissioner of Police (EOW), Nagpur City' was also forwarded by the 'Commissioner of Police Nagpur City' along with his letter dated 03.04.2023 to Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home Department wherein it is mentioned that many officers have been interrogated in connection with the Criminal Cases registered in connection with this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. Learned P.O. reiterated

that none of the officers have co-operated with the investigations and have given evasive replies to Investigating Officers. The name of the Applicant has prominently figured in the investigations and 'prima-facie' it has been found that the Applicant was connected with this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. Further it had transpired during course of investigations by Deputy Commissioner of Police (EOW), Nagpur City that the Applicant was amongst the prime suspects who had close nexus with one retired Joint Transport Commissioner of Motor Vehicles Department from Mumbai, who had played 'Master Role' in this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. The Applicant has therefore been transferred from the office of Dy. RTO; Kalyan, Thane District to the office of Dy. RTO; Beed, Beed District; as these constituted 'Special Reasons' & 'Exceptional Circumstances' under Section 4(4)(ii) of 'Maharashtra Government Servants Regulation of Transfers and Prevention of Delay in Discharge of Official Duties Act, 2005 and these have also been recorded the Minutes of Meeting of C.S.B. held on 28.04.2023 and in relevant 'File Notings'. The Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 of the Home Department (Transport) was therefore issued in keeping in mind the larger 'Public Interest' and need for upholding transparency in 'Public Administration'. Learned P.O. asserted that the credibility and reputation of the Transport Department' had been deeply eroded due to this alleged 'Transfer Scam'.

9. The learned P.O. then stated that, based on the 'Interim Report' of the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City dated 03.04.2023 the Special Meeting of CSB of Home Department (Transport) was convened on 28.04.2023 which recommended transfer of the Applicant and few Inspectors of Motor Vehicle. The recommendation made in the Special Meeting of CSB on 28.04.2023 were approved by the Hon'ble Chief Minister of Maharashtra State being both 'Competent Transferring Authority' and immediate 'Superior Transferring Authority' under provisions of Section 4(4)(ii) and Section 4(5) Maharashtra Government Servants Regulations of Transfers and Prevention of Delay in Discharge of Official Duties Act, 2005. Further, in view of observations made by Nagpur Bench in similar case by its order dated 26.06.2023 in O.A. No.

480/2023 filed by Shri. Raju Muralidhar Nagare, Inspector of Motor Vehicle; the learned P.O. stated that present O.A. No.628 of 2023 also deserves to be dismissed. The Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 issued by the Home Department (Transport) was to prevent interference by all these Inspectors of Motor Vehicles in ongoing investigation of Criminal Cases registered about this alleged 'Transfer Scam'. The 'Status of Investigation' report submitted by the Deputy Commissioner of Police, (EOW), Nagpur City dated 23.03.2023 evidently reveals the alleged role of Applicant which justifiably constitutes the 'Special Reasons' and 'Exceptional Circumstances' required to be recorded under Section 4(4)(ii) and Section 4(5) of the Maharashtra Government Servants Regulations of Transfers and Prevention of Delay in Discharge of Official Duties Act, 2005.

10. Learned P.O. emphasized that the Applicant holds transferable post of Inspector of Motor Vehicle. The powers to transfer the Applicant was inherently vested with the 'Competent Transferring Authority' which with prior approval of next 'Superior Transferring Authority' could be exercised anytime if there existed any 'Special Reasons' and 'Exceptional Circumstances'. Thus, the contention of the Applicant about noncompletion of period of Normal Tenure of Three Years on the post of 'Motor Vehicle Inspector' in office of the 'Dy. RTO; Kalyan, Thane District' cannot be accepted. There was compliance of Section 4 (4) (ii) and Section 4 (5) of Maharashtra Government Servants Regulations of Transfers and Prevention of Delay in Discharge of Official Duties Act, 2005. Transfer Order dated 24.05.2023 of Home Department (Transport) is not required to mention these 'Special Reasons' or 'Exceptional Circumstances'. The 'Special Reasons' or 'Exceptional Circumstances' have been duly recorded in Minutes of Meeting of Special CSB held on 28.04.2023 and have also been recorded in 'File Notings' submitted to 'Competent Transferring Authority' and next 'Superior Transferring Authority'. Further, the guidlines in G.A.D. G.R. dated 11.02.2015 had been taken into consideration by the C.S.B. in its Special Meeting held on 28.04.2023 as well by the 'Competent Transferring Authority and next

Superior Transferring Authority' while giving approval to all Transfer Orders of Home Department (Transport) dated 24.05.2023.

11. The learned P.O. further mentioned that from investigations under overall supervision of Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City of the Criminal Cases registered in connection with the alleged 'Transfer Scam' of Transport Department it is *prima-facie* evident that there was grave misconduct on the part of Applicant and few Motor Vehicles Inspectors which are unbecoming of Government Servants under the Maharashtra Civil Services (Conduct) Rules, 1979. Therefore as per Rule 3(2) of the Maharashtra Civil Services (Conduct) Rules, 1979; the Principal Secretary, Transport & Ports, Home Department was empowered to take such necessary steps as was required to ensure the maintenance of absolute integrity and devotion to duty by these Inspectors of Motor Vehicles and thus the 'Transfer Orders' dated 24.05.2023 has to be read as immediate justiciable action taken to enforce Rule 3(1) the Maharashtra Civil Services (Conduct) Rules, 1979. Further learned P.O. stated the 'Interim Report' submitted by the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur on 03.04.2023 mentions that the Applicant was amongst the prime suspects who had close link and nexus with one retired 'Joint Transport Commissioner of Motor Transport Department' from Mumbai Therefore CSB in its Special Meeting on 28.04.2023 after having duly considered this specific observation in the 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 of Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City had taken the wellconsidered decision to recommend transfer of even the Applicant to the office of Dy. R.T.O., Beed, Beed District. Further, it was mentioned that detailed investigations in Criminal Cases registered in connection with this alleged 'Transfer Scam' of 'Transport Department' were going on with assistance of 'E.O.W.' and Cyber Branch' of the office of 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City'.

12. The learned P.O. further mentioned that the Home Department (Transport) G.R. dated 19.03.2014 is about the constitution of C.S.B. for recommending transfers of 'Group A & Group B' officers of 'Transport

Department'. The C.S.B. for Home Department (Transport), has been constituted under the chairmanship of Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home Department with one member being the Transport Commissioner, Mumbai and the other member being Joint / Deputy Secretary (Services) GAD. She stated that no rules or guidelines have been framed by GAD in respect of quorum required for conduct of meetings of CSB by Administrative Departments. Therefore, contentions about Special Meeting of CSB dated 28.04.2023 raised by the Applicant about requirement of minimum quorum and compulsory attendance in Special Meeting of C.S.B. of the Joint/Deputy Secretary (Services), G.A.D. who is not from Home Department (Transport) have no strength of rules nor support of guidelines of G.A.D.

13. The proposal placed in the Special Meeting of C.S.B. of Home Department (Transport) held on 28.04.2023 which resulted in Transfer Orders dated 24.05.2023 of Applicant & few Inspectors of Motor Vehicle was solely based on the 'Interim Report' submitted by the 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City' on 03.04.2023 to the Principal Secretary, Transport & Ports Department who is Respondent. In the case of the Applicant the recommendation in this 'Interim Report' of 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City' dated 03.04.2023 was to post him on 'Non-Executive Post' and unlike in cases other Inspector of Motor Vehicles there was no specific recommendation that Applicant be transferred out of Nagpur Region. The relevant recommendations in Para 4 of this 'Interim Report' are reproduced below.

"8. पोलीस उप आयुक्त, आर्थिक गुन्हे शाखा, नागपूर शहर यांनी या प्रकरणाच्या चौकशी मध्ये RTO विभागातील संबंधीत अधिकारी सहकार्य करीत नसल्याने आणि स्वतंत्र साक्षीदार त्यांचे दबाबामुळे समोर येत नसल्याने व योग्य रित्या नि:नक्षपातीपणाने चौकशी करण्याकरीता खालील अधिकारी यांना नागपूर परिसराचे बाहेर तात्काळ प्रभावाने अकार्यकारी शाखेत बदली होणेस शिफारस केलेली आहे.

सदर अधिकारी १) श्री. विजय चव्हाण, उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन अधिकारी नेमणुक गडचिरोली अतिरिक्त कार्यभार नागपूर ग्रामीण २) श्री. रविंद्र भुयार, उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन नागपूर पूर्व ३) श्रीमती गिता शेजवळ, मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक, नागपूर शहर ४) श्री. कलबीर कलशी, मोटर वाहन निरक्षक, चंद्रपूर ५) श्री. संकेत गायकवाड, मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक, नागपूर ग्रामीण यांना तात्काळ प्रभावाने नागपूर परिसराचे आहेर अकार्यकारी शाखेत तसेच ६) श्री. राहुल पवार, मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक, कल्याण यांना अकार्यकारी शाखेत नेमणुक होणेस शिफारस आहे तसेच या प्रकरणात पुढील चौकशी सुरू आहे."

14. The Special Meeting of C.S.B. of Home Department (Transport) held on 28.04.2023 was convened only against the backdrop of 'Interim Report' submitted the 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur' on 03.04.2023 to decide about the recommendation for immediate transfers of Inspectors of Motor Vehicles outside of Nagpur Region to 'Non-Executive Posts'. The Special Meeting of C.S.B. held on 28.04.2023 had recommended the following transfers of Inspectors of Motor Vehicles including that of Applicant to office of Dy. R.T.O, Beed, Beed District:-

अ.	अधिका—यांचे नांव व	सध्याचे कार्यालय	सध्याच्या	शिफारस करण्यात
क्र.	पदनाम		ठिकाणी	आलेल्या कार्यालयाचे
			नियुक्तीचा	नांव
			दिनांक	
(१)	(२)	(३)	(४)	(لر)
१	श्रीमती गीता शेजवळ,	प्रादेशिक परिवहन	दिनांक २१.०९.	उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन
	मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक	कार्यालय, नागपूर	२०१८ पासून	कार्यालय, अहमदनगर
		(शहर)	आजपर्यंत	
२	श्री. कलबीर कलसी, मोटर	उप प्रादेशिक	दिनांक ०२.०४.	उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन
	वाहन निरीक्षक	परिवहन कार्यालय,	२०१८ पासून	कार्यालय, अंबेजोगाई
		चंद्रपूर	आजपर्यंत	
3	श्री. संकेत गायकवाड,	प्रादेशिक परिवहन	दिनांक ३०.०८.	उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन
	मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक	कार्यालय, नागपूर	२०२१ पासून	कार्यालय, हिंगोली
		(ग्रामीण)	आजपर्यंत	
8	श्री. राहुल पवार, मोटर	उप प्रादेशिक	दिनांक ०९.०८.	उप प्रादेशिक परिवहन
	वाहन निरीक्षक	परिवहन कार्यालय,	२०२१ पासून	कार्यालय, बीड
		कल्याण	आजपर्यंत	
ų	श्री. राजु मुरलीधर नागरे,	प्रादेशिक परिवहन		प्रादेशिक परिवहन
	मोटर वाहन निरीक्षक	कार्यालय, नागपूर	२०२० पासून	कार्यालय, औरंगाबाद
		(ग्रामीण)	आजपर्यंत	

15. The transfer of Shri R.M. Nagare, Motor Transport Inspector working as Inspector of Motor Vehicle in R.T.O. Nagpur (Rural) transferred to office of R.T.O. Aurangabad was challenged by him before the Nagpur Bench in O.A. No.480 of 2023. The following orders were passed by the Nagpur Bench in O.A. No.480 of 2023 on 26.06.2023.

"The Board recommended transfer of 4 out of 6 Officers named in the report of E.O.W. as well as letter of Police Commissioner, Nagpur. In addition, similar recommendation was made in respect of the Applicant. It was submitted by Advocate Shri S.P. Palshikar that these details will show that the impugned order is punitive in nature and for want of observance of principles of natural justice the same cannot be sustained. There is no merit in this submission. It was well within the powers of the Board to recommend transfer of a person whose transfer was not recommended either by E.O.W. or Police Commissioner, Nagpur.

In the instant case inquiry was conducted by E.O.W. It submitted a detailed report. The Board took a concrete decision to recommend transfer of the Applicant and some other. Reasons to arrive at such conclusion were recorded in minutes dated 28.04.2023. The allegations were found to be serious. The recommendation of transfer of the Applicant and four others was then placed before the immediately superior transferring authority who approved the same. Thus, the procedure stipulated in Section 4(5) of the Transfer Act and G.R. dated 11.02.2015 was followed."

The O.A. No.480 of 2023 was accordingly dismissed with 'No Order as to Costs'.

16. The Applicant has contended that while the other Inspectors of Motor Vehicles were recommended to be transferred out of Nagpur Region to 'Non-Executive Posts'; the Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City in his 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 had not recommended his transfer from the office of Dy. RTO Kalyan, District Thane. Therefore he should have been assigned to any 'Non-Executive Post' as per norms laid down in Transport Commissioner Office Order dated 24.05.2019 and retained in office of the Dy. RTO Kalyan, District Thane.

17. The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in B Varadha Rao v State of Karnataka, 1986 (3) Serv LR 60 (SC) : (1986) 4 SCC 624 : AIR 1987 SC 287 has observed that transfer is an ordinary incident of service and therefore does not result in any alteration of any condition of service to disadvantage of Government Servants. Further, it was observed that continued posting at one station or in one department not conducive to good administration as such continued posting creates vested interest. 18. The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in K. Sivankutty Nair v. Managing Director, Syndicate Bank, 1984 (2) Serv LR 13 (Kant); Chief General Manager (Telecom) v. Rajendra Ch. Bhattacharjee, (1995) 2 SCC 532 : SC 813 : (1995) 2 Serv LR 1 has also observed that an employee cannot, as a matter of right, seek transfer to a place of his choice. The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in UOI v NP Thomas, AIR 1993 SC 1605 : (1993) Supp (1) SCC 704 has further observed that since posts in public employment are generally transferable post, it follows that an employee has no vested right to remain at the post of his posting. The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in UOI v SL Abbas, AIR 1993 SC 2444 : (1993) 4 SCC 357 has also observed that who is to be transferred where, is a matter for the appropriate authority to decide.

19. The judicial precedence which deals with transfer of Government Servants in order to prevent obstruction during period of contemplation of 'Department Enquiry' or if conduct was under investigation by 'C.B.I.' is found in *Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in Civil Appeal No.1912 of 2015: Ajay kumar Chaudhari, V/s. Union of India & Anr. dated 16.02.2015* wherein it has been observed that:-

"The Government / Department is free to transfer the persons concerned to any Department in any of its offices within or outside the State so as to severe any local or personal contact that, he may have and which he may misuse for obstructing investigation against him. Government may also prohibit him from contacting any reasons or handling records and documents."

20. The Commissioner of Nagpur City by submitting the 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023 had brought on record the *prima-facie* findings of the investigations in Criminal Cases registered against the Applicant and few Inspectors of Motor Vehicles about the alleged 'Transfer Scam' in the Transport Department. The C.S.B. in its 'Special Meeting' held on 28.07.2023 after having considered all facts and circumstances of the Applicants case has taken conscious decision to go beyond the specific recommendation of 'Commissioner of Nagpur City' in 'Interim Report' dated 03.04.2023. The CSB is an independent forum consisting of senior officers to advice those exercising 'Statutory Powers' on all service

matter especially in 'Transfers' and 'Disciplinary Action' of Government Servants. Hence, the argument that CSB in its Special Meeting held on 28.07.2023 could not have gone beyond the recommendations in the 'Interim Report' submitted on 03.04.2023 by 'Commissioner of Police Nagpur City' merits no consideration. The 'Competent Transferring Authority' and next 'Superior Transferring Authority' are not subject to any normative restrictions while exercising their 'Statutory Powers' under Section 4 (4) (ii) and Section 4 (5) of Maharashtra Government Servants Regulations of Transfers and Prevention of Delay in Discharge of Official Duties Act, 2005.

21.The Applicant therefore was justifiably transferred from the post of Inspector of Motor Vehicles in office of Dy. RTO Kalyan District Thane to the post of Inspector of Motor Vehicles in the office of Dy. RTO; Beed; District Beed. However, it can be expected that investigations of 'Criminal Cases' against the Applicant and few Inspectors of Motor Vehicles about their alleged involvement in 'Transfer Scam' in the Transport Department must have made substantial progress and even 'Charge-Sheets' may have been filed against the accused in 'Courts of Law'. 'Status Reports' regarding further progress in investigation of 'Criminal Cases' regarding this alleged 'Transfer Scam' may also have been submitted by Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City; but if it has not been done so far, then it can even be obtained by 'Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home Department'; so as to exactly ascertain the nature of culpability & degree of involvement of the Applicant. The Applicant has been posted to office of 'Dy. RTO, Beed; District Beed' based on the 'Interim Report' of Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City dated 24.05.2023. Therefore, if subsequent 'Status Reports' of 'Commissioner of Police, Nagpur City' were to reveal that investigation of 'Criminal Cases' registered against the Applicant and few 'Inspectors of Motor Vehicles' about their alleged involvement in 'Transfer Scam' in the 'Transport Department' have since been completed in all respects and the Applicant has not been named as accused in any 'Charge Sheets' filed in 'Courts of Law'; then 'Principal Secretary, Transport and Ports, Home

Department' on grounds of 'Natural Justice' must review the 'Transfer Order' dated 24.05.2023 qua the Applicant and decide in reasonable time whether or not to post the Applicant back as 'Inspector of Motor Vehicles' in office of 'Dy. RTO; Kalyan, District Thane'.

### <u>O R D E R</u>

1) The Original Application is Dismissed.

2) No Order as to Costs.

Sd/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member(A)

Place: Mumbai Date: 04.01.2024. Dictation taken by: N.M. Naik.

Uploaded on:\_\_\_\_\_

F:\NAIK\2024\03-Judgment 2024\01-January 2024\0.A.628 of 2023\_J. 04.01.2024 (Transfer).doc